

Appendix 2 – Scrutiny Models of Other Local Authorities in Scotland

COUNCIL	SCRUTINY COMMITTEES	CHAIR	MEMBERSHIP	FREQUENCY
Aberdeen City	Audit Risk and Scrutiny Committee	Chair and Vice Chair members of the opposition	17 (9 Administration, 8 Opposition)	Bimonthly
Comhairle nan Eilean Siar	Audit and Scrutiny Committee	Independent administration – independent member chair, opposition vice chair	10 No member of the Policy & Resources Committee or sub committee can serve on the audit and scrutiny committee	2-3 months
East Ayrshire Council	Governance and Scrutiny Committee	Chair – Member of the main opposition group Vice Chair – Member of the other opposition group	11 Members of the Committee cannot be members of the Cabinet.	Monthly – Committee holds a workshop every January to agree topics for review.
East Renfrewshire Council	Audit and Scrutiny Committee	Chair and Vice Chair both Opposition Members	7	1-2 Months
Glasgow City Council	1- Finance and Audit Scrutiny Committee 2- Operational Delivery Scrutiny Committee	1- Opposition Chair and Vice Chair (Different Opposition Groups) 2- Opposition Chair and Vice Chair (Different Opposition Groups)	1- 15 2- 15 Both committees are made up of 8 from the Administration and 7 from the Opposition	1- Monthly 2- Every 6 weeks
Midlothian Council	1- Audit Committee 2- Performance Review and Scrutiny Committee	1- Independent Chair 2- Opposition Chair	1- 7 members (6 Councillors and 1 Independent Chair) 2- 10 Members all non-cabinet members,	1- 6-8 weeks

Renfrewshire Council	Audit, Scrutiny and Petitions Board	Administration Chair, Opposition Vice Chair	9 Members (5 Administration, 4 Opposition)	5 scheduled per year with option to call additional meetings if required. In 2015/16 there were 8 meetings.
South Ayrshire Council	<p>1- Audit and Governance Panel</p> <p>2- Service and Performance Panel</p> <p>3- Partnership Panel</p> <p>4- Public Processes Panel</p>	<p>1- Independent Chair and Administration Vice Chair</p> <p>2- Administration Chair and Vice Chair</p> <p>3- Administration Chair and Vice Chair</p> <p>4- Administration Chair and Vice Chair</p>	<p>1- 8 Members (4 Administration, 3 Opposition, 1 Independent Chair)</p> <p>2- 9 Members (6 Administration, 3 Opposition)</p> <p>3- 9 Members (6 Administration, 3 Opposition)</p> <p>4- 8 Members (4 administration, 4 opposition)</p>	All meet 5 times a year every 2-3 months
West Dunbartonshire Council	Audit and Performance Review Committee	Opposition Chair and Vice Chair	8 Members (3 Administration, 5 Opposition) + 2 Lay Members	Quarterly
Aberdeenshire Council	Scrutiny and Audit Committee	Opposition Chair, Administration Vice Chair	11 Members (4 Administration, 7 Opposition)	Every 6 weeks

City of Edinburgh Council	Governance, Risk and Best Value Committee	Opposition Chair	13 Members (8 Administration, 5 Opposition)	Monthly
Dumfries and Galloway Council	1- Audit and Risk Management Committee 2- Scrutiny and Performance Committee	1- Opposition Chair and Vice Chair 2- Opposition Chair and Vice Chair	1- 11 Members (4 Administration, 7 Opposition) 2- 11 Members – no administration members	1- Irregular – 6 meetings in 2015, only 3 to date in 2016. 2- Irregular – 6 meetings in 2015 only 3 to date in 2016
East Dunbartonshire Council	Audit and Risk Management Sub Committee (Sub Committee of Policy and Resources Committee) 2 Scrutiny Panels – Transformation and Community Wellbeing Scrutiny Panel and Transformation, Economy and Employment Scrutiny Panel	Opposition Chair and Vice Chair Opposition Chair	11 Members (Leader and Depute Leader of each political group plus independent member) 8 Members Each	Infrequent – every 2-3 months
Falkirk Council	1- Audit Committee	1- Lay Member	1- 7 Members (4 Administration, 2 Opposition, 1 lay member)	1- Quarterly

	2- Scrutiny Committee 3- Scrutiny Committee (external)	2- Opposition Chair 3- Opposition Chair	2- 8 Members (4 Administration, 4 Opposition) 3- 8 Members (4 Administration, 4 Opposition)	2- Quarterly 3- 6 times per year
Highland Council	Audit and Scrutiny Committee	Opposition Chair	22 Members (9 Administration 13 Opposition)	Quarterly
Moray Council	Audit and Scrutiny Committee	Opposition Chair and Vice Chair	11 Members (4 Administration, 7 Opposition) Plus Leader and Convener of Council	Bimonthly
Orkney Council	Monitoring and Audit Committee	Independent Chair and Orkney Manifesto Group Vice Chair Orkney is an independent council but there is one group which is made up of 3 councillors. No controlling administration.	7 Members (Convener, Vice Convener and Chairs of Service Committees are not eligible to sit on committee	5 times per year
Scottish Borders Council	1- Audit and Risk Committee 2- Scrutiny Committee	1- Opposition Chair Administration Vice Chair 2- Opposition Chair Administration Vice Chair	1- 6 Members (4 Administration, 2 Opposition plus 2 non-voting members from an external source.) Members cannot be on the executive committee. 2- 9 Members (9 Members – not on executive committee 6	1- Quarterly 2- Monthly

			Administration, 3 Opposition)	
South Lanarkshire Council	<p>1- Financial Resources Scrutiny Forum</p> <p>2- Performance and Review Scrutiny Forum</p> <p>3- Risk and Audit Scrutiny Forum</p>	<p>1- Opposition Chair – may sit on the executive</p> <p>2- Administration Chair</p> <p>3- Opposition Chair – May sit on the executive</p>	<p>1- 10 Members (6 Administration, 4 Opposition – members cannot be on the executive committee with exception of Chair)</p> <p>2- 10 Members (6 Administration, 4 Opposition)</p> <p>3- 10 Members (6 Administration, 4 Opposition – members cannot be on the executive committee with exception of Chair)</p>	<p>1- April – August meet by monthly September – March meet Monthly</p> <p>2- Once every committee cycle and as required in line with annual performance and review time table</p> <p>3- Once in each committee cycle and as required in line with annual audit cycle,</p>
West Lothian Council	1- Audit and Governance	1-Administration Chair and Vice Chair	1- 5 Members + 1 lay member (3 Administration, 2 Opposition)	1- Quarterly

	<p>2- Education (Quality Assurance)Committee</p> <p>3- Performance Committee</p>	<p>1- Chair is an independent Councillor, vice chair Administration</p> <p>2- Chair is an independent Councillor, vice chair Administration</p>	<p>2- 13 Members(9 Administration, 3 main opposition group, 1 independent)</p> <p>3- 5 Members (2 Administration, 2 main opposition group, 1 independent councillor)</p>	<p>2- One in each committee Cycle (Approximately by monthly)</p> <p>3- One in every committee cycle (Approximately by monthly)</p>
Angus Council	Scrutiny and Audit Committee	Opposition Vice Chair – Chair is currently vacant	13 Members (5 Administration, 7 Opposition – 1 vacant)	6 Weekly
Clackmannanshire Council - Change in Administration in June 2016, new decision making structure brought in 2 scrutiny committees – previously only one.	<p>1- Audit and Finance Committee</p> <p>2- Scrutiny Committee</p>	<p>1- Administration Chair</p> <p>2- Opposition Chair</p>	<p>1- 8 Member (3 Administration , 4 main opposition, 1 from neither the administration or main opposition)</p> <p>2- 8 Member (3 Administration , 4 main</p>	<p>1- Bimonthly</p> <p>2- Bimonthly</p>

			opposition, 1 from neither the administration or main opposition)	
Dundee City Council	Scrutiny Committee	Opposition Chair and Vice Chair	8 Members (4 Administration, 4 opposition (2 main opposition group))	Approximately every 2 months (slightly longer in some months due to spring, summer and autumn recess)
East Lothian Council	1- Audit and Governance Committee 2- Policy and Performance Review Committee – has responsibility for some elements of scrutiny	1- Opposition Chair and Vice Chair 2- Opposition Chair and Vice Chair	1- 8 Members (3 Administration, 5 SNP) - Non Cabinet Members 2- 8 Members (2 Administration, 6 Opposition) Non Cabinet members	1- Bimonthly 2- Approximately Bimonthly
Fife Council	2 Committees responsible for scrutiny: 1- Education, Social and Communities 2- Environment, Finance and Corporate Services	1- Opposition Chair 2- Opposition Chair	1- 16 Members (7 Administration, 9 Opposition) 2- 16 Members (7 Administration, 9 Opposition)	Both meet every 3 weeks, 2 weeks after the Executive

	Audit and Standards Committee	Opposition Chair	10 Members (5 Administration, 5 Opposition)	Every 4-6 weeks
Inverclyde Council	Audit Committee – has separate committee for scrutiny of fire and police local plans	Opposition Chair and Vice Chair	11 Members (5 Administration, 6 Opposition)	Approximately every 6 weeks
North Ayrshire	Audit and Scrutiny Committee since August 2016, previously had 2 committees (Audit and Scrutiny and Petitions)	Opposition Member	7 Members (3 Main Administration, 2 Main Opposition, 2 others) – not cabinet members	Every 6 weeks
Perth and Kinross Council	1- Audit Committee 2- Scrutiny Committee	1- Opposition Chair and Vice Chair 2- Opposition Chair and Vice Chair	1- 7 Members (3 Administration, 4 Opposition) 2- 7 Members (2 Administration, 5 Opposition)	1- Approximately every 4-6 weeks 2- Approximately every 4-6 weeks
Shetland Council	Audit Committee	All Councillors are independent	9 Members + 2 lay members 9	Monthly
Stirling Council	Audit Committee	Opposition Chair and Vice Chair	6 Members (4 Opposition, 2 administration)	5 Meetings per year